



U.S. Citizenship
and Immigration
Services

sanitizing data deleted to
prevent clearly unwarranted
invasion of personal privacy

PUBLIC COPY

DI



FILE: WAC 04 019 52909 Office: CALIFORNIA SERVICE CENTER Date: AUG 25 2005

IN RE: Petitioner: [Redacted]
Beneficiary: [Redacted]

PETITION: Petition for a Nonimmigrant Worker Pursuant to Section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the
Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b)

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER:
[Redacted]

INSTRUCTIONS:

This is the decision of the Administrative Appeals Office in your case. All documents have been returned to the office that originally decided your case. Any further inquiry must be made to that office.

Robert P. Wiemann, Director
Administrative Appeals Office

DISCUSSION: The director of the California Service Center denied the nonimmigrant visa petition and the matter is now before the Administrative Appeals Office (AAO) on appeal. The appeal will be dismissed. The petition will be denied.

The petitioner is a retail business that sells eye wear, and related products and services. It has one employee and seeks to employ the beneficiary as a marketing research analyst pursuant to section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (the Act), 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b). The director denied the petition because he determined the position was not a specialty occupation.

The record of proceeding before the AAO contains: (1) Form I-129 and supporting documentation; (2) the director's request for evidence; (3) the petitioner's response to the director's request for evidence; (3) the director's denial letter; and (4) Form I-290B, with counsel's brief. The AAO reviewed the record in its entirety before reaching its decision.

The issue before the AAO is whether the position qualifies as a specialty occupation. To meet its burden of proof in this regard, the petitioner must establish that the employment it is offering to the beneficiary meets the following statutory and regulatory requirements.

Section 214(i)(1) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (the Act), 8 U.S.C. § 1184(i)(1) defines the term "specialty occupation" as one that requires:

- (A) theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and
- (B) attainment of a bachelor's or higher degree in the specific specialty (or its equivalent) as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

The term "specialty occupation" is further defined at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(ii) as:

An occupation which requires theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge in fields of human endeavor including, but not limited to, architecture, engineering, mathematics, physical sciences, social sciences, medicine and health, education, business specialties, accounting, law, theology, and the arts, and which requires the attainment of a bachelor's degree or higher in a specific specialty, or its equivalent, as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

Pursuant to 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A), to qualify as a specialty occupation, the position must meet one of the following criteria:

- (1) A baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position;
- (2) The degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or, in the alternative, an employer may show that its particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree;
- (3) The employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position; or

- (4) The nature of the specific duties is so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree.

Citizenship and Immigration Services (CIS) interprets the term “degree” in the above criteria to mean not just any baccalaureate or higher degree, but one in a specific specialty that is directly related to the proffered position.

To determine whether a particular job qualifies as a specialty occupation, CIS does not simply rely on a position’s title. The specific duties of the proffered position, combined with the nature of the petitioning entity’s business operations, are factors to be considered. CIS must examine the ultimate employment of the alien, and determine whether the position qualifies as a specialty occupation. *Cf. Defensor v. Meissner*, 201 F. 3d 384 (5th Cir. 2000). The critical element is not the title of the position nor an employer’s self-imposed standards, but whether the position actually requires the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree in the specific specialty as the minimum for entry into the occupation, as required by the Act.

The petitioner seeks the beneficiary’s services as a marketing research analyst. Evidence of the beneficiary’s duties includes: the Form I-129 and the petitioner’s March 17, 2004 response to the director’s request for evidence. Both documents described identical duties, requiring the beneficiary to:

- Examine and analyze statistical data to forecast market trends and identify potential markets and suppliers of cheap quality eye wear, accessories and related products; and identify potential consumers; advise management on sales projections (20 percent of the beneficiary’s time);
- Research and analyze data on competitors in Los Angeles area; research events that may have impact on the industry in general using library sources and the Internet; create a data base of research findings for easy access to information when needed; from time to time review the database to ensure that it is updated, accurate and complete (20 percent of the beneficiary’s time);
- Devise methodology for research and determine formulas and models for analysis (10 percent of the beneficiary’s time);
- Collect data on client preferences and market trends and forecasts in the Los Angeles area and United States by way of surveys, questionnaires, interviews, opinion polls to assess customer/client preferences; prepare questionnaires for survey and interview (20 percent of the beneficiary’s time);
- Organize and analyze findings of surveys and research and make recommendations to management on issues such as ads and promotions, pricing of products and services and market positioning; recommend strategies for marketing campaign, networking with health providers and other sources of clientele; sourcing of supplies and products; review effectiveness of marketing campaign every six months, and recommend changes (20 percent of the beneficiary’s time); and
- Set up a system to determine the effectiveness of marketing and promotion, including a customer feedback and suggestion system, and recommend corrective measures, if needed (10 percent of the beneficiary’s time).

To make its determination whether the employment just described qualifies as a specialty occupation, the AAO turns to the criteria at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(1) and (2): a baccalaureate or higher degree or its

equivalent is the normal minimum requirement for entry into the particular position; and a degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or a particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree. Factors considered by the AAO when determining these criteria include: whether the Department of Labor's *Occupational Outlook Handbook (Handbook)*, on which the AAO routinely relies for the educational requirements of particular occupations, reports the industry requires a degree; whether the industry's professional association has made a degree a minimum entry requirement; and whether letters or affidavits from firms or individuals in the industry attest that such firms "routinely employ and recruit only degreed individuals." See *Shanti, Inc. v. Reno*, 36 F. Supp. 2d 1151, 1165 (D. Minn. 1999) (quoting *Hird/Blaker Corp. v. Sava*, 712 F. Supp. 1095, 1102 (S.D.N.Y. 1989)).

In his denial, the director, relying on the DOL *Handbook*, concluded both that the duties of the proffered position were not those of a marketing research analyst and that the record failed to establish that the petitioner's business was of a type to require a market research analyst. While the AAO concurs in the director's finding that the proffered position is not that of a market research analyst, as discussed below, it finds the director to have too narrowly defined the sectors of the economy that might require the services of a marketing research analyst. In that the 2004-2005 edition of the *Handbook* indicates that the work of marketing research analysts is concerned with the potential sales of a product or service and that they provide a company's management with information needed to make decisions on the promotion, distribution, design and pricing of products or services, market research is applicable to a broad range of industries and businesses seeking to improve their market share and profits. The fact that the petitioner is a retail establishment engaged in the selling of eye wear and services does not preclude it from engaging in the type of market research activities described by the *Handbook* as a means of increasing its business opportunities and earnings. However, the petitioner's potential need to conduct market research does not establish the proffered position as a specialty occupation.

In reaching its own conclusions regarding the nature of the proffered position, the AAO has reviewed the discussion of market or marketing research analysts, as described at pages 173-174 of the *Handbook*. It has taken particular note of the following part of that discussion:

[M]arket research analysts devise methods and procedures for obtaining the data they need. They often design telephone, mail, or Internet surveys to assess consumer preferences. Some surveys are conducted as personal interviews by going door-to-door, leading focus group discussions, or setting up booths in public places such as shopping malls. Trained interviewers, under the market research analyst's direction, usually conduct the surveys.

After compiling the data, market research analysts evaluate them and make recommendations to their client or employer based upon their findings. They provide a company's management with information needed to make decisions on the promotion, distribution, design, and pricing of products or services. The information may also be used to determine the advisability of adding new lines of merchandise, opening new branches, or otherwise diversifying the company's operations. Market research analysts might also develop advertising brochures and commercials, sales plans, and product promotions such as rebates and giveaways.

The AAO finds that it is market research analysts' work in the design, development and supervision of original market research that sets this occupation apart from what might otherwise be characterized as a marketing manager position, employment that also requires the incumbent to conduct market research. Although the petitioner indicated that the beneficiary would devise methodology for research and determine

formulas and models for analysis, it offered no discussion of whether such research would be original in nature, nor the role of the beneficiary in carrying out such research. In the absence of such information, the analysis and research responsibilities described by the petitioner appear more closely related to the work of marketing managers, whose work is also focused on the marketing and selling of products and services. As discussed within the occupation of advertising, marketing, promotions, public relations and sales managers at pages 23-24 of the *Handbook*:

The objective of any firm is to market and sell its products or services profitably Advertising, marketing, promotions, public relations, and sales managers coordinate the market research, marketing strategy, sales, advertising, promotion, pricing, product development, and public relations activities.

...

Marketing managers develop the firm's detailed marketing strategy. With the help of subordinates, including product development managers and market research managers, they determine the demand for products and services offered by the firm and its competitors. In addition, they identify potential markets Marketing managers develop pricing strategy with an eye towards maximizing the firm's share of the market and its profits while ensuring that the firm's customers are satisfied. In collaboration with sales, product development, and other managers, they monitor trends that indicate the need for new products and services and oversee product development. Marketing managers work with advertising and promotion managers to promote the firm's products and services and to attract potential users

Having found the duties of the proffered position to be those of a marketing manager, the AAO now turns to the *Handbook* for its discussion of the educational requirements imposed on individuals who seek employment within this profession:

A wide range of educational backgrounds is suitable for entry into advertising, marketing, promotions, public relations, and sales managerial jobs, but many employers prefer those with experience in related occupations plus a broad liberal arts background

For marketing, sales, and promotions management positions, some employers prefer a bachelor's or master's degree in business administration with an emphasis on marketing. Courses in business law, economics, accounting, finance, mathematics, and statistics are advantageous

...

Most advertising, marketing, promotions, public relations, and sales management positions are filled by promoting experienced staff or related professional personnel. For example, many managers are former sales representatives, purchasing agents, buyers, or product, advertising, promotions, or public relations specialists

As the *Handbook* indicates no specific degree requirement for employment as a marketing manager, the AAO concludes that the performance of the proffered position's duties does not require the beneficiary to hold a baccalaureate or higher degree in a related field. Accordingly, the AAO finds that the petitioner is unable to establish its proffered position as a specialty occupation under the requirements of the first criterion at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A).

On appeal, counsel states that the petitioner has met its burden of proof in establishing that the proffered position requires a baccalaureate degree. She contends that the petitioner's burden of proof has been met by virtue of the degree requirement the petitioner has imposed on its proffered employment. Counsel further asserts that the DOL's *Occupational Information Network (O*Net)* and its Foreign Labor Certification Data Center, both of which indicate that the occupation of marketing research analyst requires job seekers to hold a baccalaureate degree, support a degree requirement for the proffered position. She notes that the DOL has placed the position of marketing research analyst, with a Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) rating of 7, within JobZone 4, indicating that a four-year bachelor's degree is required for its performance.

While the AAO acknowledges that the petitioner desires to employ a degreed individual, its imposition of a degree requirement on the proffered position does not establish it as a specialty occupation. Were CIS limited solely to reviewing a petitioner's self-imposed requirements, then any individual with a bachelor's degree could be brought to the United States to perform any occupation as long as the employer required the individual to have a baccalaureate or higher degree.

With regard to counsel's contention that the DOL *O*Net* and Foreign Labor Certification Data Center establish the proffered position's degree requirement, the AAO notes that the proffered position is not that of a marketing research analyst, but of a marketing manager. Therefore, the degree requirements cited in the materials provided by counsel are not relevant to this proceeding. Further, the AAO does not consider the *O*Net*, which replaced the *Dictionary of Occupational Titles*, to be a persuasive source of information as to whether a job requires the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree (or its equivalent) in a specific specialty. It provides only general information regarding the tasks and work activities associated with a particular occupation, as well as the education, training, and experience required to perform the duties of that occupation. An SVP rating is meant to indicate only the total number of years of vocational preparation required for a particular occupation. It does not describe how those years are to be divided among training, formal education, and experience. Neither an SVP or JobZone 4 rating specifies the particular type of degree that a position would require.

To establish its proffered position as a specialty occupation under the second criterion, a petitioner must prove that a specific degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations, or that the proffered position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree in the specific specialty. The AAO has reviewed the record before it and has found the petitioner to have submitted no evidence to establish that its degree requirement is the norm within its industry. Further, although the petitioner in its March 17, 2004 response to the director's request for evidence asserted that its degree requirement was the result of the complexity of its proffered employment, there is no evidence in the record to support the petitioner's statements in this regard. Simply going on record without supporting documentary evidence is not sufficient for the purposes of meeting the burden of proof in these proceedings. *Matter of Soffici*, 22 I&N Dec. 158, 165 (Comm. 1998) (citing *Matter of Treasure Craft of*

California, 14 I&N Dec. 190 (Reg. Comm. 1972)). Accordingly, the AAO concludes that the proffered position cannot be established as a specialty occupation under either prong of the second criterion.

The AAO next considers the criteria at 8 C.F.R. §§ 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(3) and (4): the employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position; and the nature of the specific duties is so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree.

To determine a petitioner's ability to meet the third criterion, CIS often reviews the position's employment history, including the names and dates of employment of those employees with degrees who previously held the position, as well as the petitioner's hiring practices with regard to similar positions. However, as the petitioner has indicated that the proffered position is newly created, it can provide no evidence that would meet the requirements of the third criterion.

The fourth criterion at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A) requires a petitioner to establish that the nature of its position's duties is so specialized and complex that the knowledge required to perform them is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree. While, the petitioner has asserted that the duties of its proffered position are normally identified with the attainment of a bachelor's degree in business administration, marketing or a related field of study, the AAO's review of the duties of the proffered position does not find them to reflect a higher degree of knowledge and skill than would normally be required of a marketing manager or to represent an amalgam of jobs that would require the beneficiary to possess skills and qualifications beyond those of a marketing manager. The AAO, therefore, concludes that the proffered position cannot be established as a specialty occupation under the requirements at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(4).

The petitioner, in response to the director's request for evidence, pointed to the AAO's approval of several cases involving market research analyst positions, which, it contended, involved employment similar to that described in the instant petition. However, CIS approval of a previous petition, even if for similar employment, does not provide a basis for approving the instant petition. CIS is not bound to approve applications or petitions where eligibility has not been demonstrated merely because of prior approvals that may have been erroneous. *See, e.g. Matter of Church Scientology International*, 19 I&N Dec. 593, 597 (Comm. 1988). Each petition filing is a separate proceeding with a separate record and CIS is limited to the information contained in that record in reaching its decision. 8 C.F.R. §§ 103.2(b)(16)(ii) and 103.8(d).

Therefore, for the reasons related in the preceding discussion, the petitioner has failed to establish that the proffered position qualifies as a specialty occupation under the requirements at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A). Accordingly, the AAO shall not disturb the director's denial of the petition.

The burden of proof in these proceedings rests solely with the petitioner. Section 291 of the Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1361. The petitioner has not sustained that burden.

ORDER: The appeal is dismissed. The petition is denied.