



D2

U.S. Department of Justice

Immigration and Naturalization Service

identifying data deleted to prevent clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy

OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS
425 Eye Street N.W.
ULLB, 3rd Floor
Washington, D.C. 20536



File: EAC-01-192-54377

Office: Vermont Service Center

Date: FEB 10 2003

IN RE: Petitioner:

Beneficiary:



Petition: Petition for a Nonimmigrant Worker Pursuant to Section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 U.S.C. 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b)

IN BEHALF OF PETITIONER:



PUBLIC COPY

INSTRUCTIONS:

This is the decision in your case. All documents have been returned to the office that originally decided your case. Any further inquiry must be made to that office.

If you believe the law was inappropriately applied or the analysis used in reaching the decision was inconsistent with the information provided or with precedent decisions, you may file a motion to reconsider. Such a motion must state the reasons for reconsideration and be supported by any pertinent precedent decisions. Any motion to reconsider must be filed within 30 days of the decision that the motion seeks to reconsider, as required under 8 C.F.R. 103.5(a)(1)(i).

If you have new or additional information that you wish to have considered, you may file a motion to reopen. Such a motion must state the new facts to be proved at the reopened proceeding and be supported by affidavits or other documentary evidence. Any motion to reopen must be filed within 30 days of the decision that the motion seeks to reopen, except that failure to file before this period expires may be excused in the discretion of the Service where it is demonstrated that the delay was reasonable and beyond the control of the applicant or petitioner. Id.

Any motion must be filed with the office that originally decided your case along with a fee of \$110 as required under 8 C.F.R. 103.7.

FOR THE ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER,
EXAMINATIONS

Robert P. Wiemann, Director
Administrative Appeals Office

DISCUSSION: The nonimmigrant visa petition was denied by the director and is now before the Associate Commissioner for Examinations on appeal. The appeal will be dismissed.

The petitioner is a long-term care facility with 46 employees and an approximate gross annual income of \$2 million. It seeks to employ the beneficiary as a charge nurse for a period of three years. The director determined the petitioner had not established that the proffered position is a specialty occupation or that the beneficiary is qualified to perform the duties of a specialty occupation.

On appeal, counsel submits a brief.

Section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (the Act), 8 U.S.C. 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b), provides in part for nonimmigrant classification to qualified aliens who are coming temporarily to the United States to perform services in a specialty occupation. Section 214(i)(1) of the Act, 8 U.S.C. 1184(i)(1), defines a "specialty occupation" as an occupation that requires theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and attainment of a bachelor's or higher degree in the specific specialty (or its equivalent) as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

Pursuant to section 214(i)(2) of the Act, 8 U.S.C. 1184(i)(2), to qualify as an alien coming to perform services in a specialty occupation the beneficiary must hold full state licensure to practice in the occupation, if such licensure is required to practice in the occupation. In addition, the beneficiary must have completed the degree required for the occupation, or have experience in the specialty equivalent to the completion of such degree and recognition of expertise in the specialty through progressively responsible positions relating to the specialty.

Pursuant to 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(C), to qualify to perform services in a specialty occupation, the alien must meet one of the following criteria:

1. Hold a United States baccalaureate or higher degree required by the specialty occupation from an accredited college or university;
2. Hold a foreign degree determined to be equivalent to a United States baccalaureate or higher degree required by the specialty occupation from an accredited college or university;
3. Hold an unrestricted State license, registration, or certification which authorizes him or her to fully

practice the specialty occupation and be immediately engaged in that specialty in the state of intended employment; or

4. Have education, specialized training, and/or progressively responsible experience that is equivalent to completion of a United States baccalaureate or higher degree in the specialty occupation and have recognition of expertise in the specialty through progressively responsible positions directly related to the specialty.

The beneficiary holds a bachelor of science degree in nursing conferred by an institution in the Philippines. She also holds a certificate from the Commission of Graduates of Foreign Nursing Schools. Accordingly, it is concluded that the petitioner has shown that the beneficiary qualifies to perform the duties of the proffered position.

Section 214(i)(1) of the Act, 8 U.S.C. 1184(i)(1), defines the term "specialty occupation" as an occupation that requires:

- (A) theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and
- (B) attainment of a bachelor's or higher degree in the specific specialty (or its equivalent) as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(ii) further defines the term "specialty occupation" as:

an occupation which requires theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge in fields of human endeavor including, but not limited to, architecture, engineering, mathematics, physical sciences, social sciences, medicine and health, education, business specialties, accounting, law, theology, and the arts, and which requires the attainment of a bachelor's degree or higher in a specific specialty, or its equivalent, as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

Pursuant to 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A), to qualify as a specialty occupation, the position must meet one of the following criteria:

- (1) A baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position;
- (2) The degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or, in the

alternative, an employer may show that its particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree;

(3) The employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position; or

(4) The nature of the specific duties is so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree.

In the petition, counsel for the petitioner emphasized that the duties of the offered position were so specialized that they could be performed only by a person with a baccalaureate degree.

In support of his claim that the proffered position required a degree, counsel submitted a letter dated January 4, 2001, from the petitioner's administrator who stated that in accordance with established practice, the proffered position is recognized as a professional position requiring a baccalaureate degree. Counsel also submitted copies of pages from various publications in support of his claim, and a news release from the Department of Veterans Affairs (DVA) indicating that it had recently endorsed a policy whereby all registered nurses employed in its medical facilities and hospitals would be required to hold a baccalaureate degree in nursing. Counsel also submitted a position statement by the American Association of Colleges of Nursing, recognizing the bachelor of science degree in nursing as the minimum educational requirement for professional nursing practice.

The petitioner submitted an organization chart and a list of 14 nurses currently or previously employed as charge nurses, all of whom hold a baccalaureate degrees in nursing.

Counsel does not present a persuasive argument for classifying the offered position as a specialty occupation. In evaluating whether the offered position is a specialty occupation, each of the four criteria listed at 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h) (4) (iii) (A) will be considered separately below.

I. A baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position - 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h) (4) (iii) (A) (1)

The Service often looks to the DOL's Handbook when determining whether a baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into a particular position. In the 2002-2003 edition of the Handbook at page 269, the DOL states the following about the training and educational requirements for registered nurse/supervisory nurse positions:

There are three major educational paths to registered nursing: associate degree in nursing (A.D.N.), bachelor of science degree in nursing (B.S.N.), and diploma.

. . . Generally, licensed graduates of any of the three program types qualify for entry-level positions as staff nurses.

. . . some career paths are open only to nurses with bachelor's or advanced degrees. A bachelor's degree is often necessary for administrative positions, and it is a prerequisite for admission to graduate nursing programs in research, consulting, teaching, or a clinical specialization.

The petitioner is offering to the beneficiary the position of a registered nurse/supervisory nurse. The offered position is not an administrative position which, depending upon the duties of the position, may require the attainment of a bachelor's or higher degree for the position. The DOL, which is an authoritative source for educational requirements for certain occupations, does not indicate that a bachelor's degree in a specific specialty is the minimum requirement for any registered nurse position, including the type being offered to the beneficiary.

II. The degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or, in the alternative, an employer may show that its particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree - 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(2)

Factors often considered by the Service when determining the industry standard include: whether the DOL's Handbook reports that the industry requires a degree, whether the industry's professional association has made a degree a minimum entry requirement, and whether letters or affidavits from firms or individuals in the industry attest that such firms "routinely employ and recruit only degreed individuals." Shanti, Inc. v. Reno, 36 F.Supp.2d 1151, 1165 (D.Min. 1999) (quoting Hird/Blaker Corp. v. Slattery, 764 F.Supp. 872, 1102 (S.D.N.Y. 1991)).

The DOL's conclusions about a degree requirement for a registered nurse position were discussed in the previous section, and shall not be repeated here. Regarding information from professional nursing associations, neither counsel nor the petitioner presents evidence that any nursing association has made a baccalaureate or higher degree a minimum entry requirement.

The pages from the publication, Dimensions of Professional Nursing, 8th Edition, Copyright 1999, are noted. Although not explicitly

stated, counsel suggests that such publication indicates that the proffered position has been recognized by the nursing industry as complex and requiring a baccalaureate degree. It is noted, however, that page 333 of such publication states that the requirements for employment in nursing positions in extended and long-term care facilities are similar to those in hospitals for like positions, "although often the need for a degree is not emphasized." (Emphasis added.)

Also noted is the page from another publication, Encyclopedia of Careers and Vocational Guidance, 11th Edition, Copyright 2000. Here again, although not explicitly indicated, counsel suggests that such publication indicates that a bachelor's degree in nursing is required for most supervisory or administrative positions. The cited reference on page 368 states, however, that a bachelor's degree in nursing is required for most supervisory or administrative positions for jobs in public health agencies, and for admission to graduate nursing programs. It is noted that the petitioner is neither a public health agency nor a graduate nursing program.

The news release regarding the DVA's hiring practices for its registered nurse positions is noted. Although not explicitly stated, counsel suggests that the DVA's enactment of a policy that mandates its registered nurses to have baccalaureate degrees indicates that a degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions. The Service, however, does not find counsel's conclusion persuasive.

Although the DVA is the largest employer of registered nurses, it is just one example of an organization that employs registered nurses. The newspaper advertisements from other health care facilities are noted. The petitioner, however, has not presented any other evidence, such as letters or affidavits from hospitals or other employers of registered nurses, that such organizations "routinely employ and recruit only degreed individuals" for the position of a registered nurse. See Shanti, Inc. v. Reno, supra at 1165. One employer's hiring practices does not exemplify the industry standard.

The Service strongly disagrees with counsel that the policy enacted by the DVA is the "position of the government." The DVA is merely one government agency among many, and its policies are not binding on the Service. As previously stated, the DVA's stipulated educational requirements for its registered nurses do not represent the nursing industry or all employers of registered nurses. Therefore, the Service is not bound to find that the position of a registered nurse is a specialty occupation simply because the DVA has determined that it, alone, shall require its registered nurses to hold a baccalaureate degree.

The Service further contends that the DVA may not be considered a "similar organization," as it employs approximately 36,000 registered nurses, whereas the petitioner employs far less than this number of registered nurses. Instead of relying solely on the DVA's educational requirements, the petitioner should have presented information regarding the educational requirements for registered nurses in facilities that are similar to the size and scope of its operations, in order to establish that a degree in a specific field of study is common to the industry in parallel positions within similar organizations.

Additionally, counsel has not presented any evidence that the offered position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with at least a baccalaureate degree.

III. The employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position - 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(3)

In a cover letter dated January 4, 2001, the petitioner's administrator states, in part, that the petitioner's position of professional nurse requires a baccalaureate degree in nursing or an equivalent.

Although the petitioner's past hiring practices indicate that it normally requires a baccalaureate degree in nursing for the proffered position, the petitioner's reasoning is problematic when viewed in light of the statutory definition of specialty occupation. The petitioner's creation of a position with a perfunctory bachelor's degree requirement will not mask the fact that the position is not a specialty occupation. As with employment agencies as petitioners, the Service must examine the ultimate employment of the alien, and determine whether the position qualifies as a specialty occupation. Cf. Defensor v. Meissner, 201 F.3d 384 (5th Cir. 2000). The critical element is not the title of the position or an employer's self-imposed standards, but whether the position actually requires the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and the attainment of a bachelor's degree in the specific specialty as the minimum for entry into the occupation as required by the Act.¹ To interpret the regulations any other way would lead to absurd results: if the Service was limited to reviewing a petitioner's self-imposed employment requirements, then any alien with a bachelor's degree could be brought into the United States to

¹ The court in Defensor v. Meissner observed that the four criteria at 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A) present certain ambiguities when compared to the statutory definition, and "might also be read as merely an additional requirement that a position must meet, in addition to the statutory and regulatory definition." Supra at 387.

perform a menial, non-professional, or an otherwise non-specialty occupation, so long as the employer required all such employees to have bachelor's degrees. See id. at 388.

In this case, although the petitioner claimed to have hired only individuals with a bachelor's degree in nursing for its charge nurse positions, the position, nevertheless, does not meet the statutory definition of specialty occupation. The position, itself, does not require the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge. Therefore, even though the petitioner has required a bachelor's degree in the past, the position still does not require a bachelor's degree in a specific specialty.

- IV. The nature of the specific duties are so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree - 8 C.F.R. 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(4)**

Counsel contends that the proffered position is a "professional level" nursing position and, therefore, encompasses specialized and complex duties that can only be performed by an individual who has attained a baccalaureate or higher degree.

The assertions of counsel do not constitute evidence. Matter of Obaigbena, 19 I&N Dec. 533, 534 (BIA 1988); Matter of Ramirez-Sanchez, 17 I&N Dec. 503, 506 (BIA 1980). Although counsel contends that the position of a charge nurse requires the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree due to the complex and sophisticated nature of the position's specific duties, counsel does not present any evidence in support of his assertions. Furthermore, although counsel refers to a charge nurse position as a "professional level" position, counsel does not demonstrate that the nursing industry is comprised of "professional level" and "entry-level" positions.

Based upon the evidence in the record, the petitioner has not established that the proffered position is a specialty occupation. As with employment agencies as petitioners, the Service must examine the ultimate employment of the alien, and determine whether the position qualifies as a specialty occupation. See Cf. Defensor v. Meissner, supra. The critical element is not the title of the position, but whether the position actually requires the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and the attainment of a bachelor's degree in the specific specialty as the minimum for entry into the occupation as required by the Act.

In this case, the petitioner has not shown that the practice of the proffered charge nurse position requires the attainment of a bachelor's degree in a specific specialty.

The burden of proof in these proceedings rests solely with the petitioner. Section 291 of the Act, 8 U.S.C. 1361. The petitioner has not sustained that burden.

ORDER: The appeal is dismissed.