



U.S. Citizenship
and Immigration
Services

identifying data deleted to
prevent clearly unwarranted
invasion of personal privacy

PUBLIC COPY

D2

FEB 27 2007

FILE: EAC 04 263 50662 Office: VERMONT SERVICE CENTER Date:

IN RE: Petitioner:
Beneficiary:

PETITION: Petition for a Nonimmigrant Worker Pursuant to Section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the
Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b)

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER:

INSTRUCTIONS:

This is the decision of the Administrative Appeals Office in your case. All documents have been returned to the office that originally decided your case. Any further inquiry must be made to that office.

Robert P. Wiemann, Chief
Administrative Appeals Office

DISCUSSION: The service center director denied the nonimmigrant visa petition and the matter is now before the Administrative Appeals Office (AAO) on appeal. The appeal will be dismissed. The petition will be denied.

The petitioner is a manpower staffing company and seeks to employ the beneficiary as a computer programmer. The petitioner endeavors to classify the beneficiary as a nonimmigrant worker in a specialty occupation pursuant to section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (the Act), 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b).

The director determined that the proffered position did not qualify as a specialty occupation. The petition was accordingly denied. On appeal, counsel submitted a brief stating that the proffered position qualified as a specialty occupation.

The issue to be determined is whether the proffered position qualifies as a specialty occupation.

Section 214(i)(1) of the Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1184(i)(1), defines the term “specialty occupation” as an occupation that requires:

- (A) theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and
- (B) attainment of a bachelor’s or higher degree in the specific specialty (or its equivalent) as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

The term “specialty occupation” is further defined at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(ii) as:

An occupation which requires theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge in fields of human endeavor including, but not limited to, architecture, engineering, mathematics, physical sciences, social sciences, medicine and health, education, business specialties, accounting, law, theology, and the arts, and which requires the attainment of a bachelor’s degree or higher in a specific specialty, or its equivalent, as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

Pursuant to 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A), to qualify as a specialty occupation, the position must meet one of the following criteria:

- (1) A baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position;
- (2) The degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or, in the alternative, an employer may show that its particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree;
- (3) The employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position; or
- (4) The nature of the specific duties is so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree.

Citizenship and Immigration Services (CIS) interprets the term “degree” in the above criteria to mean not just any baccalaureate or higher degree, but one in a specific specialty that is directly related to the proffered position.

The petitioner seeks the beneficiary’s services as a computer programmer. Evidence of the beneficiary’s duties includes the Form I-129 petition with attachment and the petitioner’s response to the director’s request for evidence. According to evidence provided by the petitioner the beneficiary would:

- Convert data from project specifications and statements of problems and procedures to create or modify computer programs;
- Analyze workflow charts and diagrams, applying knowledge of computer capabilities, subject matter and symbolic logic;
- Analyze and evaluate clients’ procedures and computerized business systems as a basis for recommending revisions and formulating modifications or changes to streamline operations;
- Develop and maintain new systems to accomplish the identified requirements, and document the program system flow and other elements into a users manual;
- Analyze business procedures and problems to refine data and convert it to programmable form for electronic data processing;
- Confer with personnel of organizational units involved to ascertain specific output requirements such as types of breakouts, degree of data summarization and format for management reports;
- Study existing data handling systems to evaluate effectiveness and develop new systems to improve production or workflow as required;
- Plan and prepare technical reports, memoranda and instructional manuals relative to the establishment and functioning of complete operational systems;
- Correct program errors, using methods such as modifying programs or altering sequence of program steps; and
- Compile and write documentation of program development and subsequent revisions.

The petitioner finds the beneficiary qualified to perform the duties of the proffered position by virtue of her foreign education which has been determined by a credentials evaluation service to be equivalent to a bachelor of science degree in computer engineering from an accredited college or university in the United States.

The beneficiary’s position has been identified by the petitioner as a computer programmer. The Department of Labor’s *Occupational Outlook Handbook (Handbook)* notes that although there are many training paths

available for programmers due to varied employer needs, the level of education and experience employers seek has been rising due to the growing number of qualified applicants and the specialization involved with most programming tasks. Bachelor's degrees are commonly required, although some programmers may qualify for certain jobs with 2-year degrees or certificates. The associate degree is a widely used entry-level credential for prospective computer programmers. In the absence of a degree, substantial specialized experience or expertise may be needed, and employers appear to place more emphasis on previous experience even when hiring programmers with a degree. Some computer programmers hold a college degree in computer science, mathematics, or information systems, while others have taken special courses in computer programming to supplement degrees in other fields. Thus, it is evident that while some programmer positions justify the hiring of an individual with a baccalaureate level education, others require only an associate's degree or some other form of certification.

The evidence of record establishes that the petitioner is an employment contractor in that the petitioner will place the beneficiary at multiple work locations to perform services established by contractual agreements with third-party companies. The petitioner does not assert or establish that the beneficiary will be employed as an in-house computer programmer for the petitioner. The court in *Defensor v. Meissner*, 201 F. 3d 384 (5th Cir. 2000) held that for the purpose of determining whether a proffered position is a specialty occupation, the petitioner acting as an employment contractor is merely a "token employer," while the entity for which the services are to be performed is the "more relevant employer." The *Defensor* court recognized that evidence of the client companies' job requirements is critical where the work is to be performed for entities other than the petitioner. The court held that the legacy Immigration and Naturalization Service had reasonably interpreted the statute and regulations as requiring the petitioner to produce evidence that a proffered position qualifies as a specialty occupation on the basis of the requirements imposed by the entities using the beneficiary's services. The petitioner, however, has provided no contracts, work orders or statements of work from the party for whom the beneficiary will actually perform services specifically describing the duties the beneficiary would perform and, therefore, has not established the proffered position as a specialty occupation. As the record does not contain any documentation from the end user of the beneficiary's services that establishes the specific duties the beneficiary would perform under contract, the AAO cannot analyze whether these duties would require at least a baccalaureate degree or the equivalent in a specific specialty, as required for classification as a specialty occupation. Accordingly, the petitioner has not established that the proposed position qualifies as a specialty occupation under any of the criteria at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(A) or that the beneficiary would be coming temporarily to the United States to perform the duties of a specialty occupation pursuant to 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(1)(B)(I). The petition must, therefore, be denied.

The director also makes reference to matters outside the record in issuing its denial of the present petition. If matters outside the record adverse to the petitioner come to the director's attention and are considered in denying a petition, the director should first issue a Notice of Intent to Deny (NOID) giving the petitioner an opportunity to respond to any adverse information considered. The director should also make any such adverse information considered a part of the record. A portion of the information referenced by the director in denying the petition concerns the number of positions petitioned for and approved in unrelated cases, and the petitioner's inconsistent statements concerning employment of those individuals. The petitioner should note that it must notify CIS of any change in employment circumstances of any beneficiary approved for H-1B classification pursuant to C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(11)(i)(A).

The petitioner states that the petition should be approved because CIS had approved other similar petitions. Each nonimmigrant petition is a separate proceeding with a separate record. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.8(d). In making a determination of statutory eligibility, CIS is limited to the information contained in the record of proceeding. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.2(b)(16)(ii). Although the AAO may attempt to hypothesize as to whether the prior case was similar to the proffered position or was approved in error, no such determination may be made without review of the original record in its entirety. If the prior petition was approved based on evidence that was substantially similar to the evidence contained in this record of proceeding, however, the approval of the prior petition would have been erroneous. Citizenship and Immigration Services (CIS) is not required to approve petitions where eligibility has not been demonstrated, merely because of prior approvals that may have been erroneous. *See, e.g., Matter of Church Scientology International*, 19 I&N Dec. 593, 597 (Comm. 1988). Neither CIS nor any other agency must treat acknowledged errors as binding precedent. *Sussex Engg. Ltd. v. Montgomery* 825 F.2d 1084, 1090 (6th Cir. 1987), *cert denied*, 485 U.S. 1008 (1988).

This record of proceeding does not contain the entire record of proceedings in the petitions referred to by counsel. Accordingly, no comparison of the positions can be made. Each nonimmigrant petition is a separate proceeding with a separate record. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.8(d). In making a determination of statutory eligibility, the AAO is limited to the information contained in the record of proceeding. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.2(b)(16)(ii). It warrants noting that Congress intended this visa classification for aliens that are to be employed in an occupation that requires the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge. Congress specifically stated that such an occupation would require, as a *minimum* qualification, a baccalaureate or higher degree in the specialty. CIS regularly approves H-1B petitions for qualified aliens who are to be employed as engineers, computer scientists, certified public accountants, college professors, and other such professions. These occupations all require a baccalaureate degree in the specialty occupation as a minimum for entry into the occupation and fairly represent the types of professions that Congress contemplated when it created that visa category. In the present matter, the petitioner has offered the beneficiary a position as a computer programmer. For the reasons discussed above, the proffered position does not require attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree in a specific specialty as a minimum for entry into the occupation, and approval of a petition for another beneficiary based on identical facts would constitute material error and a violation of 8 C.F.R. § 214.2 paragraph (h).

The burden of proof in these proceedings rests solely with the petitioner. Section 291 of the Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1361. The petitioner has failed to sustain that burden.

ORDER: The appeal is dismissed. The petition is denied.