

identifying data deleted to
prevent clearly unwarranted
invasion of personal privacy



U.S. Citizenship
and Immigration
Services

PUBLIC COPY



Dr

MAY 26 2006

FILE: EAC 04 245 50959 Office: VERMONT SERVICE CENTER Date:

IN RE: Petitioner: [Redacted]
Beneficiary: [Redacted]

PETITION: Petition for a Nonimmigrant Worker Pursuant to Section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b)

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER:



INSTRUCTIONS:

This is the decision of the Administrative Appeals Office in your case. All documents have been returned to the office that originally decided your case. Any further inquiry must be made to that office.

Robert P. Wiemann, Chief
Administrative Appeals Office

DISCUSSION: The director of the Vermont Service Center denied the nonimmigrant visa petition and the matter is now before the Administrative Appeals Office (AAO) on appeal. The appeal will be dismissed. The petition will be denied.

The petitioner is a food service company, with 17 employees. It seeks to employ the beneficiary as an accountant pursuant to section 101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b) of the Immigration and Nationality Act (the Act), 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(15)(H)(i)(b). The director denied the petition because he determined the position was not a specialty occupation.

The record of proceeding before the AAO contains: (1) Form I-129 and supporting documentation; (2) the director's request for additional evidence; (3) counsel's response to the director's request; (4) the director's denial letter; and (5) Form I-290B, with counsel's brief. The AAO reviewed the record in its entirety before issuing its decision.

The issue before the AAO is whether the proffered position qualifies as a specialty occupation. To meet its burden of proof in this regard, the petitioner must establish that the job it is offering to the beneficiary meets the following statutory and regulatory requirements.

Section 214(i)(1) of the Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1184(i)(1), defines the term "specialty occupation" as an occupation that requires:

- (A) theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and
- (B) attainment of a bachelor's or higher degree in the specific specialty (or its equivalent) as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

The term "specialty occupation" is further defined at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(ii) as:

An occupation which requires theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge in fields of human endeavor including, but not limited to, architecture, engineering, mathematics, physical sciences, social sciences, medicine and health, education, business specialties, accounting, law, theology, and the arts, and which requires the attainment of a bachelor's degree or higher in a specific specialty, or its equivalent, as a minimum for entry into the occupation in the United States.

Pursuant to 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A), to qualify as a specialty occupation, the position must meet one of the following criteria:

- (1) A baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position;
- (2) The degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or, in the alternative, an employer may show that its particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree;
- (3) The employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position; or

- (4) The nature of the specific duties is so specialized and complex that knowledge required to perform the duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree.

Citizenship and Immigration Services (CIS) interprets the term “degree” in the above criteria to mean not just any baccalaureate or higher degree, but one in a specific specialty that is directly related to the proffered position.

To determine whether a particular job qualifies as a specialty occupation, CIS does not simply rely on a position’s title. The specific duties of the proffered position, combined with the nature of the petitioning entity’s business operations, are factors to be considered. CIS must examine the ultimate employment of the alien, and determine whether the position qualifies as a specialty occupation. *Cf. Defensor v. Meissner*, 201 F. 3d 384 (5th Cir. 2000). The critical element is not the title of the position nor an employer’s self-imposed standards, but whether the position actually requires the theoretical and practical application of a body of highly specialized knowledge, and the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree in the specific specialty as the minimum for entry into the occupation, as required by the Act.

The petitioner seeks the beneficiary’s services as an accountant. Evidence of the beneficiary’s duties includes: the Form I-129 and the petitioner’s letter of support, and counsel’s response to the director’s request. As described by the petitioner, the duties of the proffered position include:

- Applying principles of accounting to analyze the petitioner’s past and present financial operations and estimate its future revenues and expenditures – with end in view of helping the petitioner in its fiscal decisions (30 hrs a week or 100% of duty as a continuing responsibility);
- Preparing the company’s annual and monthly budget, evaluating its financial and fiscal performance, managing cost projections and containment, by using accounting software and tools, to arrive at workable figures acceptable to management (6 hrs a week or 20% of duty);
- Analyzing the petitioner’s records of past and present operations, trends and costs, estimated and realized revenues, administrative commitments and obligations incurred to project future expenses, using computer based analysis (6 hrs a week or 20% of duty);
- Using accounting software packages, preparing a written summary of daily and weekly transactions in standard formats for financial analysis, and submitting to management (4 hrs a week or 13% of duty);
- Documenting revenues and expenditures by collecting file receivables and expense accounts, then arranging these neatly in a folder format for easy examination (4 hrs a week or 13% of duty);
- Maintaining budgeting systems which provide control of expenses to carry out activities, such as advertising and marketing, production, maintenance, etc., and coordinating with the personnel concerned in the preparation of budget outlay (4 hrs a week or 13% of duty);
- Coordinating with external accountant in the preparation of company’s tax returns and acting as the company’s liaison officer with federal and local revenue agencies by holding a regular weekly meeting with the external accountant for information and documentation sharing (2 hrs a week or 6% of duty);
- Rendering advisory opinions to the company’s officers regarding financial/tax matters, including doing a monthly presentation of graphs and figures (1 hr a week or 3% of duty);
- Auditing the company’s contracts, orders and vouchers (by doing in depth scrutiny of such documents to detect possible irregularities or anomalies against the [petitioner]), and preparing reports to substantiate individual transactions (2 hrs a week or 6% of duty); and
- Performing other functions as may be pertinent to the job (1 hr a week or 3% of duty).

The petitioner stated that the duties of the proffered position require a bachelor's or Master's degree in accounting.

To make its determination whether the employment just described qualifies as a specialty occupation, the AAO turns to the criteria at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A)(1) and (2): a baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is the normal minimum requirement for entry into the particular position; and a degree requirement is common to the industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or a particular position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree. Factors considered by the AAO when determining these criteria include: whether the Department of Labor's *Occupational Outlook Handbook (Handbook)*, on which the AAO routinely relies for the educational requirements of particular occupations, reports the industry requires a degree; whether the industry's professional association has made a degree a minimum entry requirement; and whether letters or affidavits from firms or individuals in the industry attest that such firms "routinely employ and recruit only degreed individuals." See *Shanti, Inc. v. Reno*, 36 F. Supp. 2d 1151, 1165 (D. Minn. 1999) (quoting *Hird/Blaker Corp. v. Sava*, 712 F. Supp. 1095, 1102 (S.D.N.Y. 1989)).

The petitioner has stated that the proffered position is that of an accountant. To determine whether the duties of the proffered position support the petitioner's characterization of its employment, the AAO turns to the 2006-2007 edition of the *Handbook* for its discussion of management accountants, the category of accounting most closely aligned to the duties described by the petitioner. As stated by the *Handbook*, management accountants:

[r]ecord and analyze the financial information of the companies for which they work. Among their other responsibilities are budgeting, performance evaluation, cost management, and asset management They analyze and interpret the financial information that corporate executives need in order to make sound business decisions. They also prepare financial reports for other groups, including stockholders, creditors, regulatory agencies, and tax authorities. Within accounting departments, management accountants may work in various areas, including financial analysis, planning and budgeting, and cost accounting.¹

The AAO finds the above discussion to be generally reflected in the petitioner's description of the duties of the proffered position and agrees that the petitioner's employment would require the beneficiary to have an understanding of accounting principles. However, not all accounting employment is performed by degreed accountants. Therefore, the performance of duties requiring accounting knowledge does not establish the proffered position as that of an accountant. The question is not whether the petitioner's position requires knowledge of accounting principles, which it does, but rather whether it is one that normally requires the level of accounting knowledge that is signified by at least a bachelor's degree, or its equivalent, in accounting.

The *Handbook's* discussion of the occupation of accountants clearly indicates that accounting positions may be filled by individuals holding associate degrees or certificates, or who have acquired their accounting expertise through experience:

Capable accountants and auditors may advance rapidly; those having inadequate academic preparation may be assigned routine jobs and find promotion difficult. Many graduates of junior colleges or business or correspondence schools, as well as bookkeepers and accounting

¹ *Occupational Outlook Handbook*, 2006-2007 Edition, at www.bls.gov/oco/ocos001.htm.

clerks, who meet the education and experience requirements set by their employers, can obtain junior accounting positions and advance to positions with more responsibilities by demonstrating their accounting skills on the job.

It also notes in its description of the work performed by bookkeeping, accounting and auditing clerks that:

Demand for full-charge bookkeepers is expected to increase, because they are called upon to do much of the work of accountants, as well as perform a wider variety of financial transactions, from payroll to billing. Those with several years of accounting or bookkeeper certification will have the best job prospects.²

Further proof of the range of academic backgrounds that may prepare an individual for accounting employment is provided by the credentialing practices of the Accreditation Council for Accountancy and Taxation (ACAT), an independent accrediting and monitoring organization affiliated with the National Society of Accountants. The ACAT does not require a degree in accounting or a related specialty to issue a credential as an Accredited Business Accountant® /Accredited Business Advisor® (ABA). Eligibility for the eight-hour comprehensive examination for the ABA credential requires only three years of “verifiable experience in accounting, taxation, financial services, or other fields requiring a practical and theoretical knowledge of the subject matter covered on the ACAT Comprehensive Examination.” Up to two of the required years of work experience may be satisfied through college credit.³

To determine whether the accounting knowledge required by the proffered position rises above that which may be acquired through experience or an associate’s degree in accounting,⁴ the AAO turns to the record for information regarding the nature of the petitioner’s business operations. While the size of a petitioner’s business is normally not a factor in determining the nature of a proffered position, both level of income and organizational structure are appropriately reviewed when a petitioner seeks to employ an H-1B worker as an accountant. In cases where a petitioner’s business is relatively small, the AAO reviews the record for evidence that its operations, are, nevertheless, of sufficient complexity to indicate that it would employ the beneficiary in an accounting position requiring a level of financial knowledge that may be obtained only through a baccalaureate degree in accounting or its equivalent.

At the time of filing, the petitioner stated that it employed 17 employees. The petitioner indicated on the Form I-129 that its gross annual income was \$450,000. The petitioner’s submitted a U.S. Return of Partnership income for tax year 2001 indicating gross receipts or sales of \$497,157, gross profit of \$268,217 and salaries of \$76,817. Accordingly, the AAO has reviewed the record for evidence of the petitioner’s expansion, as well as its financial structure and operations, to determine whether the accounting employment described by the petitioner would impose a degree requirement on the beneficiary.

² *Occupational Outlook Handbook*, 2006-2007 Edition, at www.bls.gov/oco/ocos144.htm.

³ Information provided by the ACAT website (<http://www.acatcredentials.org/index.html>). The *Handbook* identifies the ACAT website as one of several “Sources of Additional Information” at the end of its discussion of the occupation of accountants.

⁴ According to the website for Skyline College, a community college located in San Mateo, CA (www.skylinecollege.net), an associate’s degree in business or accounting would involve learning the fundamentals about financial accounting principles and concepts, balance sheets, income statements, cash flow statements, the GAAP, forecasting, budgeting, cost accounting, break even analysis, developing and operating a computerized accounting system. Thus, an associate’s degree would provide knowledge about the GAAP and accounting techniques that serve the needs of management and facilitate decision-making.

The AAO does not agree that the business operations and income asserted by the petitioner at the time of filing would create a potentially complex financial environment requiring accounting knowledge acquired through a four-year degree in accounting.

In response to the director's request for evidence, counsel submitted a listing of the petitioner's positions, which included Food Service Management Coordinators, marketing specialist, the proffered position of accountant, 3 branch managers, food technologist/nutritionist, and 14 kitchen and food service staff. Although the director requested a copy of its lease or rental agreement of office space, the petitioner did provide one. The petitioner claims to own and operate several food outlets or counters yet has provided no evidence of the outlets or counters. Going on record without supporting documentary evidence is not sufficient for purposes of meeting the burden of proof in these proceedings. *Matter of Soffici*, 22 I&N Dec. 158, 165 (Comm. 1998) (citing *Matter of Treasure Craft of California*, 14 I&N Dec. 190 (Reg. Comm. 1972)).

Although counsel contends that the petitioner is "now in the midst of a major expansion program, which has resulted in the sudden increase in complexity of the [petitioner's] financial audits of the [petitioner's] financial affairs," his assertions are insufficient to establish the financial complexity of the petitioner's business. Without documentary evidence to support the claim, the assertions of counsel will not satisfy the petitioner's burden of proof. The assertions of counsel do not constitute evidence. *Matter of Obaigbena*, 19 I&N Dec. 533, 534 (BIA 1988); *Matter of Laureano*, 19 I&N Dec. 1 (BIA 1983); *Matter of Ramirez-Sanchez*, 17 I&N Dec. 503, 506 (BIA 1980).

Having submitted no evidence to support its statements regarding its business and income, the petitioner has failed to demonstrate that its financial operations are of sufficient complexity to indicate that it would employ the beneficiary in a position requiring a level of accounting knowledge that may only be obtained through a baccalaureate degree in accountancy. Accordingly, the duties of the proffered position are not established as those of a degreed accountant. Instead, they appear more closely aligned to the accounting responsibilities that may be performed by junior accountants, employment that does not impose a baccalaureate degree requirement on those seeking entry-level employment. Therefore, the petitioner has not established the proffered position as a specialty occupation under the first criterion at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(A) – a baccalaureate or higher degree or its equivalent is normally the minimum requirement for entry into the particular position.

On appeal, counsel asserts that CIS has already determined that the proffered position is a specialty occupation since CIS has approved other, similar petitions in the past. This record of proceeding does not, however, contain all of the supporting evidence submitted to service center in the prior case. In the absence of all of the corroborating evidence contained in those records of proceeding, the documents submitted by counsel are not sufficient to enable the AAO to determine whether the positions offered in the prior cases were similar to the position in the instant petition.

Each nonimmigrant petition is a separate proceeding with a separate record. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.8(d). In making a determination of statutory eligibility, CIS is limited to the information contained in the record of proceeding. *See* 8 C.F.R. § 103.2(b)(16)(ii). Although the AAO may attempt to hypothesize as to whether the prior cases were similar to the proffered position or were approved in error, no such determination may be made without review of the original records in their entirety. If the prior petitions were approved based on

evidence that was substantially similar to the evidence contained in this record of proceeding, however, the approval of the prior petitions would have been erroneous. Citizenship and Immigration Services (CIS) is not required to approve petitions where eligibility has not been demonstrated, merely because of prior approvals that may have been erroneous. *See, e.g., Matter of Church Scientology International*, 19 I&N Dec. 593, 597 (Comm. 1988). Neither CIS nor any other agency must treat acknowledged errors as binding precedent. *Sussex Engg. Ltd. v. Montgomery* 825 F.2d 1084, 1090 (6th Cir. 1987), *cert denied*, 485 U.S. 1008 (1988). The Administrative Appeals Office is never bound by a decision of a service center or district director. *Louisiana Philharmonic Orchestra v. INS*, 2000 WL 282785 (E.D. La.), *aff'd* 248 F.3d 1139 (5th Cir. 2001), *cert. denied*, 122 S.Ct. 51 (2001).

Counsel asserts that the fact that the beneficiary possesses a master's degree in business administration should support the assertion that the proffered position is for an accountant. Counsel asserts that the size and scope of the petitioner's business as a food service franchise operator are sufficient to support an accountant.

To establish the proffered position as a specialty occupation under the second criterion at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(A), a petitioner must prove that a specific degree requirement is common to its industry in parallel positions among similar organizations or that the proffered position is so complex or unique that it can be performed only by an individual with a degree. The petitioner submitted several newspaper advertisements for the position of accountant. The petitioner submitted no evidence that the advertising organizations are similar to the petitioner or that the duties of the advertised positions are parallel to the proffered position. The petitioner also submitted a letter from a newspaper distributorship company which states that it used to employ a part-time accountant. The petitioner has not established that this company is a similar organization or that its position of accountant is similar to the one generally described in the letter. In the instant case, the petitioner has submitted insufficient evidence to satisfy either prong of the criterion. Therefore the record does not establish the proffered position as a specialty occupation based on an industry-wide degree requirement or its complex and unique nature.

To determine whether a proffered position may be established as a specialty occupation under the third criterion – the employer normally requires a degree or its equivalent for the position – the AAO usually reviews the petitioner's past employment practices, as well as the histories, including names and dates of employment, of those employees with degrees who previously held the position, and copies of those employees' diplomas. The petitioner has not established that it previously employed a degreed accountant in the proffered position.

The fourth criterion requires a petitioner to establish that the nature of the specific duties of its position is so specialized and complex that the knowledge required to perform these duties is usually associated with the attainment of a baccalaureate or higher degree. The AAO, however, finds no evidence to indicate that the beneficiary's duties would require greater knowledge or skill than that normally possessed by junior accountants. Counsel asserts that the petitioner owns and operates several food service outlets. The record contains no evidence of the number or type of food service outlets. Without documentary evidence to support the claim, the assertions of counsel will not satisfy the petitioner's burden of proof. The unsupported assertions of counsel do not constitute evidence. *Matter of Obaighena*, 19 I&N Dec. 533, 534 (BIA 1988); *Matter of Laureano*, 19 I&N Dec. 1 (BIA 1983); *Matter of Ramirez-Sanchez*, 17 I&N Dec. 503, 506 (BIA 1980). Further, the position, as described, does not appear to represent a combination of jobs that would require the beneficiary to have a unique set of skills beyond those of a junior accountant. As a result, the

record fails to establish that the proffered position meets the specialized and complex threshold of the fourth criterion at 8 C.F.R. § 214.2(h)(4)(iii)(A).

For reasons related in the preceding discussion, the petitioner has failed to establish the proffered position as a specialty occupation. Accordingly, the AAO shall not disturb the director's denial of the petition.

The burden of proof in these proceedings rests solely with the petitioner. Section 291 of the Act, 8 U.S.C. § 1361. The petitioner has not sustained that burden.

ORDER: The appeal is dismissed. The petition is denied.